American Economic Review 2023, 113(6): 1–44 https://doi.org/10.1257/aer.20210413

Reconciliation Narratives: The Birth of a Nation after the US Civil War[†]

By Elena Esposito, Tiziano Rotesi, Alessandro Saia, and Mathias Thoenig*

We study how the spread of the Lost Cause narrative—a revisionist and racist retelling of the US Civil War—shifted opinions and behaviors toward national reunification and racial discrimination against African Americans. Looking at screenings of The Birth of a Nation, a blockbuster movie that greatly popularized the Lost Cause after 1915, we find that the film shifted the public discourse toward a more patriotic and less divisive language, increased military enlistment, and fostered cultural convergence between former enemies. We document how the racist content of the narrative connects to reconciliation through a "common-enemy" type of argument. (JEL J15, L82, N31, N32, N41, Z13)

History is a set of lies agreed upon.

-Napoleon Bonaparte

Although recurrent wars and persistent hatred are common throughout history, former enemies have also been known to reconcile, sometimes quite suddenly.¹ One such famous reconciliation was between France and Germany, which fought three wars in less than a century but went on to become founding nations of the European Union. What are the cultural drivers of these reversals of distrust and animosity?

*Esposito: University of Turin (ESOMAS Department); Collegio Carlo Alberto and CEPR (email: e.esposito@unito.it); Rotesi: Department of Economics, University of Lausanne (email: tiziano.rotesi@unil.ch); Saia: Department of Economics, University of Bologna (email: alessandro.saia@unibo.it); Thoenig: Department of Economics, University of Lausanne, University of Oxford, IMD Business School, and CEPR (email: mathias.thoenig@unil.ch). Stefano DellaVigna was the coeditor for this article. We thank Esther Duflo, and four anonymous referees as well as Scott Abramson, Desmond Ang, Ruben Durante, and Hans-Joachim Voth for their helpful comments. We thank the participants of seminars and conferences at Cambridge, IMD, King's College, Queen's University of Vienna, Zurich, Policy for Peace Conference 2020, NBER Summer Institute 2021, CEPR-EIEF-TorVergata Media and Politics Workshop 2022, and the Political Economics of Conflict and Nation-Building Conference 2022. We thank Daniel Rosenlehner for excellent research assistance. Elena Esposito, Tiziano Rotesi, and Alessandro Saia acknowledge financial support from the SNF-Grant (185167). Mathias Thoenig acknowledges financial support from the SNF-Grant (182242).

[†]Go to https://doi.org/10.1257/aer.20210413 to visit the article page for additional materials and author disclosure statements.

¹Collier and Hoeffler (2005) find that more than two-thirds of conflict outbreaks take place in countries where multiple conflicts have been recorded. DeRouen and Bercovitch (2008) document that a large majority of civil wars stem from enduring rivalries. More broadly, Voigtländer and Voth (2012) and Voth (2020) discuss the persistence of hatred and hostile attitudes.